

Regional Disparities Analysis among Regencies and Cities in Indonesia 2015–2019

by Recky Sendouw

Submission date: 16-Jan-2023 10:16AM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 1993330104

File name: 622-1234-1-SM.pdf (384.48K)

Word count: 6506

Character count: 33510

Open Access Article

Evaluation of Universal Basic Education Policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency, North Sulawesi Province

Abdul Rahman Dilapanga¹, Budiman Rusli², Heru Nurasa², Soni A. Nulhaqim², Recky H. E. Sendouw¹

¹ Manado State University, Tondano, Indonesia

² Padjadjaran University, Bandung, Indonesia

Received: October 14, 2022 ▪ Reviewed: November 5, 2022

Accepted: November 15, 2022 ▪ Published: December 30, 2022

8

Abstract:

The goal of this study was to evaluate the universal basic education policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency, North Sulawesi Province, Indonesia. This study uses the policy evaluation theory of William Dunn with six evaluation criteria, namely: effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equity, responsiveness, and accuracy. This study uses qualitative research methods, with a grounded theory approach, data collection techniques through interviews, observation, and documentation. Informants in this study were determined purposively (purposive sampling), with snowball sampling technique. The data analysis technique uses an interactive model analysis from Miles and Huberman. The results of this study indicate that the results of the evaluation of basic educational policies are oriented to four universal education substances: attainment of basic education universal education, implementation of basic education curriculum, student learning outcomes, and budget realization. Based on the results the analysis of the four substances, it turns out that the effectiveness of the universal basic education policy at the elementary school level has met the target; at the junior high school level, it has not met the target. Efficiency in the evaluation of universal basic education policies in Bolaang Mongondow Regency has not been fully achieved based on the effectiveness criteria. The aspect of adequacy in the evaluation of universal basic education policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency is that in conditions of changing costs and effectiveness, the policy is to maximize the ratio of effectiveness to cost. The smoothing criteria show that universal basic education services at the SD/MI level have been evenly distributed, but at the SMP/MTs level, efforts are still being made. Responsiveness criteria in the evaluation of the universal education policy for basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency show that it is increasing along with growing awareness about the importance of education for their children. Accuracy criteria in the evaluation of universal basic education policies in the Bolaang Mongondow Regency can be met.

Keywords: policy evaluation, universal education, basic education.

4
北苏拉威西省博兰蒙贡多县普及基础教育政策评估

2

This article is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>)

12 摘要:

37 34
48 12 47
35 46
41 31
20 26 36
44 45
32 33
43
本研究⁴⁸的目的是评估印度尼西亚北苏拉威西省博兰蒙贡多摄政的普及基础教育政策。本研究采用威廉¹²·邓恩的政策评价理论，提出了六个评价标准³⁵：有效性、效率、充分⁴⁶性、公平性、响应性和准确性。本研究⁴⁷使用定性研究方法⁴¹，采用扎根理论方法³¹，通过访谈、观察和记录收集数据。本研究³¹的信息提供者是有目的的（目的抽样），采用滚雪球抽样技术³⁶。数据分析技术使用英里和休伯曼的交互式模³⁶分析。本研究²⁰结果表²⁶，基础教育政策的评价结果面向四个普及教育实质：基础教育普及²⁶教育的实现、基础教育课程的实施、学生的学习成果和预算的实现。从四项实质分析结果来看，小学阶段普⁴⁴基础教育政策的有效性达到了目标；在初中阶段，还没有达⁴⁵到目标。根据有效性标准，博兰蒙贡多摄政普及基础教育政策的评估效率尚未完全实现。博兰蒙贡多摄政普及基础教育政策评估的充分性方面是在成本和效果变化的情况下，政策是最大化效果与成本的比率。平滑标准表明，标准差/机械手层面的普及基础教育服务分布均匀，但在上模/多模层面³²仍在努力。博兰蒙贡多摄政基础教育普及教育政策评估中的响应标准表³³明，随着人们对教育对其子女的重要性的认识不断提高，响应标准也在提高。可以满足博兰蒙贡多摄政区普及基础教育政策评估的准确性标准。

关键词：政策评估、普及教育、基础教育。

1. Introduction¹⁶

Article 26, paragraph 1 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights states: Everyone has the right to education. In the 1945¹⁴ Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, Article 31, paragraph 1: Every citizen has the right to education; paragraph 2: Every citizen must attend basic education and the government has to pay for it.

Universal education for basic education has been proclaimed and implemented since May 2, 1984, which was preceded by the movement of six years of universal education or universal elementary school education.²⁰ In years later, on May 2, 1994, it was increased to nine years of universal basic education, namely six years of universal education at SD/MI/equivalent⁷ and three years at SMP/MTs/equivalent. Universal education is a minimum education program that must be followed by Indonesian citizens on the responsibility of the government and⁹ local governments. Universal education provides minimum education for Indonesian citizens to be able to develop their potential so that they can live independently in society or continue their education to a higher level.

Based on data from the Central Bureau of Statistics of Bolaang Mongondow Regency in 2014, the average length of schooling (RLS) for the population of Bolaang Mongondow Regency was 7.48 years, in other words, the average was only elementary school graduates or junior high school/MTs graduates. Universal basic education as a policy has been implemented, for this reason, it is necessary to follow up with evaluation activities to obtain a picture of the gap between expectations and achievement of universal basic education. Based on this problem, research was conducted on the Evaluation of Basic Education Universal Education Policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency, North Sulawesi Province, to obtain field

findings, analyze and interpret field data to develop a new concept of evaluating basic education universal education policies."

2. Literature Review

A public policy cannot be released or left alone after it has been established and implemented, but the policy must be¹⁵ monitored, and one such monitoring mechanism is referred to as "policy evaluation." The evaluation is usually aimed at assessing the extent to which the effec²⁹tiveness of public policies is accountable to the public, the extent to which the objectives are achieved. The evaluation is needed to see the gap between "expectations" and "reality" (Solichin, 2008).

The main purpose of the evaluation is not to find faults in its implementation but to see how large the gap is between the achievements and expectations of a public policy. The next task is how to reduce or close the gap. So the policy evaluation aims to find deficiencies and cover or correct deficiencies that occur (Mantiri, 2019).

In the evaluation of policy performance, it is always associated with resources under its authority such as human resources, funds, infrastructure, work methods, and other interrelated matters. Jones (1991) defines policy evaluation as follows: "Evaluation is an activity designed to weigh the benefits of government programs and processes. It varies in the specification of criteria, measurement techniques, methods of analysis, and forms of recommendations."

There are many definitions of policy evaluation. Dye (2017) offers a broad definition and states that "policy evaluation is learning about the consequences of public policy." Furthermore, Dye (2017) also explained that "policy evaluation research is the objective, systematic, empirical examination of the effect ongoing policies and public programs have on their targets in terms of

the goals they are meant to achieve."

To generate information about policy performance, policy analysts use different types and criteria to evaluate policy performance. The types of criteria in the evaluation of policy performance are closely related to the criteria for recommendations. The difference lies in the timing of its application. The criteria for evaluating policy performance are applied retrospectively (ex-post), while the criteria for policy recommendations are applied prospectively (ex-ante). The types of criteria for policy evaluation are summarized by Dunn (2003) in Table 1.

Table 1. Evaluation criteria

Criteria Type	Question	Illustration
Effectiveness	Have the desired results been achieved?	Service Unit
Efficiency	How much effort must achieve the desired result?	Unit cost, net benefit, Cost-benefit ratio.
Adequacy	To what extent does achieving the desired result solve the problem?	Fixed cost. Fixed effectiveness.
Alignment	Are the cost benefits distributed evenly among different groups?	Pareto Criteria. Kaldor-Hicks Criteria. Rawls Criteria.
Responsiveness	Do policy outcomes satisfy the needs, preferences, or values of particular groups?	Consistency with a citizen survey
Accuracy	Is the desired outcome (goal) useful or valuable?	Public programs must be equitable and efficient.

If viewed from the time dimension, the evaluation of policy implementation can be studied from three time dimensions: before implementation, during implementation, and after implementation. Evaluation at the time of implementation is also referred to as process evaluation, while evaluation after the policy is implemented, is referred to as policy consequence evaluation or also known as summative evaluation (Mangkunegara, 2006).

James P. Lester and Joseph Steward, Jr. (Nugroho, 2008) classify the evaluation of policy implementation into process evaluation, namely evaluations relating to the implementation process; impact evaluation, namely evaluation regarding the results and/or the effect of policy implementation; policy evaluation, namely whether the results achieved reflect the desired goals; and meta-evaluation evaluation, which is concerned with evaluating various implementations of existing policies to find certain commonalities.

As a comparison, Howlet and Ramesh (Nugroho, 2008) divided the evaluation into three aspects:

1. Administrative evaluation, which is concerned with evaluating the administrative-budgetary, efficiency, cost-side of the policy process within the government concerning:

a. effort evaluation, which assesses from the input

side of the program developed by the policy.

b. performance evaluation, which assesses the output of the program developed by the policy.

c. adequacy of performance evaluation or effectiveness evaluation, which assesses whether the program is executed as determined.

d. efficiency evaluation, which assesses program costs and provides an assessment of the effectiveness of these costs.

2. Judicial evaluation, which is related to the issue of legal validity where the policy is implemented, including possible violations of the constitution, legal system, ethics, state administration rules, to human rights.

3. Political evaluation, which is to assesses the extent to which political constituents accept the implemented public policies.

More specifically, Dunn (2003) suggests three approaches to evaluating policy implementation, namely quasi-evaluation, formal evaluation, and evaluation of theoretical decisions.

3. Research Method

This study uses qualitative research methods, with a grounded theory approach, data collection techniques through interviews, observation, and documentation. Informants in this study were determined purposively (purposive sampling), with snowball sampling technique. The data analysis technique uses an interactive model analysis from Miles and Huberman. Meanwhile, to test the validity of the data, the four criteria proposed by Moleong (2017) were used, namely: a) the degree of confidence, b) the degree of transferability, c) the degree of dependence, and d) the degree of certainty.

4. Results and Discussion

The results of the study generally describe that the evaluation of the universal education program for basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency is carried out periodically which is oriented to four substances: 1) Achievement of nine-year universal basic education; 2) Implementation of the basic education curriculum; 3) Students' learning outcomes in the basic education; 4) Budget realization for the nine-year universal basic education program.

Based on the results of the study, it can be explained that what has been done and how the evaluation of the universal education policy for basic education is carried out by the evaluator team of the Bolaang Mongondow Regency Education Office, in essence, it is per Government Regulation Number 47 of 2008 concerning Universal Education, in article 8 paragraph (1), and (2) it is explained that:

1) The government, provincial governments, and district/city governments evaluate the implementation of universal education programs regularly.

2) Evaluation of 28: implementation of the universal education program as referred to in paragraph (1) shall at least include:

- a. Universal education achievement level;
- b. Implementation of the basic education curriculum;
- c. Student learning outcomes;
- d. Budget realization.

External evaluation of the universal basic education program has also been carried out by the DPRD of Bolaang Mongondow Regency through Commission III as a partner of the Education Office, which continues to monitor conducting its supervisory function of the executive and the course of development programs. Periodically, Commission III also confirms and asks for information 38: or explanations from the Education Office regarding the implementation of development in the field of education, including the progress of completing the universal basic education program.

4.1. Effectiveness Aspects in Evaluation of Universal Basic Education Policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency

Measures or indicators of achievement or effectiveness of universal education are described or described based on the Pure Participation Rate (NER) and Gross Enrollment Rate (GER). The results of the evaluation of universal basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency, North Sulawesi Province are:

a. The NER for SD/MI in 2014 was 95.7%, the average NER for SD in the last five years (2010 to 2014) was 94.14%, while the NER for SMP/SMPLB/MTs in 2014 was 62.46% with the average in the last five years being 62.98%;

b. GER SD/MI in 2014 was 111.3%, the average in the last five years (2010-2014) was 103.47%, while GER for SMP/SMPLB/MTs in 2014 was 80.05% with an average in the last five years of 79.81%. However, by looking at the composition of schools at both 24: elementary and junior high school levels, which do not have special schools, it gives a message that children with special needs have not been touched by the policy of universal basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency.

Nationally, according to the Presidential Instruction of the Republic of Indonesia Number 5 of 2006 concerning the National Movement for the Acceleration of Universal Completion of Basic Education, it instructs to (a) increase the percentage of elementary school/madrasah education students to the population aged 7-12 years or the net enrollment rate (NER) to be at least 95% by the end of 2008; (b) increase the percentage of junior high school/madrasah/tsanawiyah/equivalent education students for the population aged 13-15 years or the gross enrollment rate (GER) to at least 95% by the end of 2008. Compared with the criteria for completeness of universal education with APK 95% according to the

Presidential Instruction above, mandatory study of basic education at the SMP/MTs level in Bolaang Mongondow Regency is incomplete (not yet effective).

Dunn (2003) argues that effectiveness is concerned with whether an alternative achieves the expected result (effect), or achieves the goal of taking action. In this sense, the effectiveness criteria are one of the measures to produce information on program performance related to the assessment of universal basic education policies in the Bolaang Mongondow Regency (Dunn, 2003).

If the NER and GER are used as effectiveness values, the universal basic education policy at the SD/MI level in Bolaang Mongondow Regency has met and even exceeded the effectiveness value set long before so that it can be categorized as complete (very effective). However, at the SMP/MTs level, although the GER has reached 80.05% and is classified as good, it has not yet reached the point of effectiveness set nationally so that it is categorized as incomplete (not yet effective).

However, the facilities and infrastructure as well as the financing of the universal basic education program are available and meet the needs, but it must also be acknowledged that the presence of teachers cannot be replaced in determining the effectiveness of 44: the implementation of the basic education curriculum. The results of this study indicate that in general, Bolaang Mongondow Regency still lacks teachers, including at the basic education level (SD/SMP). This condition in itself gives a signal that the implementation of the basic education curriculum has not been effective. The effectiveness of implementing a good basic education curriculum will ultimately be reflected in the quality or quantity of student learning outcomes.

The results of this study indicate that the learning outcomes of universal basic education students obtained through UASBN and UAN in the last four years at the SD/MI level averaged 7.28 (from year to year there was an increase); at the SMP/MTs level, the average was 7.28. The last four years have never moved from the average value of 7.5. The learning outcomes of these students, although they cannot be said to be less effective, also cannot be categorized as very effective.

If the achievement of the policy objectives for universal education in basic education is greater, the effectiveness will be greater. The ineffectiveness of completing the universal education policy for basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency, especially at the SMP/MTs level, because some children of universal education age (SD/MI graduates) and some citizens who have universal education age children have not fully complied with the universal basic education policy as regulated in article 12, Government Regulation No. 47 of 2008 concerning Universal Education, which affirms that: (1) Every Indonesian citizen of universal school age must take part in the universal education program, (2) Every Indonesian

citizen who has universal education age children is responsible for providing universal education for their children.

4.2. Efficiency Aspects in Evaluation of Universal Basic Education Policy in Bolaang Mongondow District

The efficiency relates to the number of efforts made to achieve a certain level of effectiveness or to achieve the stated policy objectives effectively. In the context of the evaluation the universal basic education policy, the efficiency of the universal basic education policy relates to the efforts made by the government and local governments in increasing the desired achievement of universal basic education.

The efforts made by the government through the Bolaang Mongondow Regency Education Office to achieve the effectiveness of the universal basic education program are:

a. Funding for school operations through BOS funds for SD/SDLB/MI and SMP/SMPLB/SMPT/SATAP and public and private MTs;

b. The BOS fund for universal basic education has continued to increase in the last five years so that it can help and ease the burden on schools in conducting school operations;

c. In the 2015 fiscal year, there has been an increase in SD/MI BOS funds from Rp. 580,000/student/year, increased to Rp. 710,000,-/student/per year, and for SMP/MTs increased from Rp. 850,000,-/student/year, to Rp. 1.000.000,-/student/year;

d. The procurement of facilities/infrastructure for the universal basic education program funded through the Special Allocation Fund (DAK) of the Bolaang Mongondow District Education Office, in the last five years has been directed at: construction of new school units (USB) specifically for junior high schools, construction of new elementary/junior high school classrooms, rehabilitation elementary/junior high school buildings, rehabilitation of elementary/junior high school classrooms, construction of elementary/junior high school libraries, construction of science laboratories for junior high schools, procurement of textbooks in the fields of study: mathematics, science, social studies, and Indonesian language education for elementary/junior high schools, procurement of learning equipment/media SD/SMP, providing tables/benches/chairs for elementary/junior high school students;

e. Another effort that is not less important to improve the efficiency of basic education services is to increase the professional ability of teachers, through online teacher competency tests, training/upgrades, certification, Teacher Group Consultations (KKG), Subject Teacher Consultations (MGMP). All of these efforts are directed at improving the implementation of a quality basic education curriculum.

The efficiency of universal education policy in basic education is strongly influenced by the support of the government, local government, and the community. Law Number: 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System, Article 34, paragraphs 2 and 3 mandate that:

“(2) The government and regional governments guarantee the implementation of universal education at the minimum level of basic education without charging any fees; (3) Universal education is the responsibility of the state-organized by government education institutions, local governments, and the community.”

The evaluation results show that the government and local government guarantees in terms of financing the operation of basic education units implementing universal education programs have been fulfilled by the government, which from year to year always experiences an increase which is annealed directly to their respective school accounts in the form of school operational assistance funds (BOS).

The unfulfilled needs for education facilities and infrastructure in education units (SMP/MTs) to administer universal education programs are the responsibility of the Government and regional governments, as confirmed in Government Regulation No. 47 of 2008, Article 11, paragraph 1:

“The government and regional governments guarantee the availability of land, facilities, and infrastructure other than education land for each education unit implementing the universal education program organized by the Government or regional governments per their respective authorities.”

The efficiency criterion in policy evaluation is not a single criterion because efficiency is closely related to effectiveness. Therefore, to measure the efficiency of the universal education policy for basic education, it must at least be compared with the achievement of the objectives (effectiveness) obtained through the implementation of the universal education policy for basic education. If the four aspects/indicators of the evaluation of the basic education universal education policy have achieved high effectiveness, the efficiency criteria will automatically be achieved. However, the results of this study indicate that the four evaluation indicators of the universal education program that have been evaluated by the evaluator team of the Bolaang Mongondow District Education Office, have not all achieved the expected effectiveness. Thus, efficiency has not been fully achieved based on the effectiveness criteria.

4.3. Aspects of Sufficiency in the Evaluation of Universal Basic Education Policy in Bolaang Mongondow District

The criterion of adequacy relates to the question: How far does achieving the desired result solve the problem? Sufficiency in public policy can be said to be fulfilled if the goals achieved are felt to be sufficient

and meet the needs, values, or opportunities, because adequacy is still related to effectiveness by measuring or predicting how far the actions taken have satisfied the needs, values, and opportunities in solving the problems faced. The aspect of the adequacy of the universal education policy for basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency has not been fully met, because it is not sufficient and fulfills all the needs, values, and opportunities to obtain basic education, with the argument that:

a. The achievement of universal basic education, especially GER at the education unit or SMP/MTs level, which is still in the range of 80.05%, although it is good, has not reached the adequacy of the national standard set out according to the Presidential Instruction No. 5 of 2006, with an APK of 95% at the end of 2008.

b. The implementation of the basic education curriculum is still constrained by inadequate facilities and infrastructure, especially at the SMP/MTs level.

c. The lack of and Nowell-distributed teachers so that they affect the implementation of a curriculum that is less than optimal ultimately impact learning outcomes that are not optimal.

d. The existence of SMPT and SATAP as an alternative in the distribution of basic education has not met the value of justice in obtaining basic education services; unavailability of SLB (SDLB/SMPLB) indicates that the needs and rights of citizens have not been fulfilled, as well as the value of justice and the opportunity to obtain education for children with special needs to obtain basic education.

Dunn (2003) argues that "sufficiency is concerned with the extent to which a level of effectiveness satisfies the needs, values, or opportunities that foster the problem³⁰" Furthermore, he also explained that adequacy emphasizes the strong relationship between policy alternatives and the expected results. Dunn (2003) further explained the adequacy criteria regarding four types of problems: 1) fixed costs and changing effectiveness, 2) regarding the same effectiveness and changing costs, 3) regarding changing costs and changing effectiveness, 4) containing the same costs and changing costs, fixed effectiveness.

Based on the study results, the cost of the universal basic education program continues to increase from year to year. The increase in costs is given to increase the effectiveness of the achievement of universal basic education policies, in other words, maximizing the effectiveness of increasing or changing costs and changing effectiveness. Although the results of the study indicate that the effectiveness of universal education policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency has not reached the effectiveness according to the national universal education completeness criteria, it continues to experience changes in a more effective direction in line with the increasing (changing) cost adequacy. Therefore, the researchers mapped that the adequacy

criteria in the evaluation of the universal education policy for basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency were at the top of the problem of changing costs and changing effectiveness. Here, the policy is to maximize the ratio of effectiveness to cost.

4.4. Aspects of Smoothing in the Evaluation of Universal Basic Education Policies in Bolaang Mongondow Regency

The criterion for equity in public relates to the question: Are the cost benefits distributed equally among different groups? Equity in public policy can be said to be related to the justice given and obtained or enjoyed by the target group.

The nine-year universal education policy is designed to distribute basic education opportunities for children aged 7–12 years (SD/MI) and children aged 13–15 years (SMP/MTs). The policy of universal education for basic education is recommended onis of t¹⁷ criteria for equalization or equal rights to education. Based on the results of the analysis of research data obtained through interviews and documentation studies, the interpretation results are as follows:

a. There has been an equal distribution of basic education at the SD/MI level in Bolaang Mongondow Regency because there is easy access to the availability of SD/MI in all rural areas, but equality at the SMP/MTs level has not been met.

b. The distribution of SD/MI has not been followed by the availability of teachers evenly so that the impact on student learning outcomes recorded through UASBN results has not been optimal. At the SMP/MTs level, there is still a shortage of teachers and it is unevenly distributed, especially in the fields of Mathematics, English, and Counseling Guidance (BK) teachers.

c. The absence of SLB (SDLB/SMPLB) causes children with special needs to be neglected in obtaining the opportunity to enjoy basic education.

d. There has been an even distribution of basic education universal education funding through BOS funding assistance to schools.

Equity or equity in public policy can be said to be related to the justice given and obtained or enjoyed by the target group. Dunn (2003, p. 434) argues that "equity is related to legal and social rationality and refers to the distribution of consequences and efforts between different groups in society." Equitable-oriented policies are policies in which service units, businesses, and funds are distributed fairly to the target group of the policy. The nine-year universal education policy is designed to distribute basic education opportunities for children aged 7–12 years (SD/MI) and children aged 13–15 years (SMP/MTs). Universal basic education policies are recommended based on equalization or equality criteria.

4.5. Responsiveness Aspects in the Evaluation of Universal Basic Education Policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency

Dunn (2003) explains that "responsiveness is concerned with how far the policy can satisfy the needs, preferences, or values of certain community groups." Dunn further explained that "the responsiveness criterion is important because an analysis that can satisfy all other criteria (effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, equality) still fails if it does not address the actual needs of the groups that should benefit from the existence of a policy" (Wollman, 2013).

Responsiveness criteria in the universal basic education policy relate to the question: Have the results of the evaluation of the universal basic education policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency satisfied the needs, preferences, or values of certain groups (the community as the target group)? The results of interviews and documentation studies on the evaluation of the universal basic education program in Bolaang Mongondow Regency, the researchers did not find any documents and information that explained the public's response to the basic education universal education program, because the evaluators did not ask for and evaluate the public's response to the implementation of the basic education universal education program. However, by analyzing the results of the implementation of the basic education universal education program, which continues to increase and the absence of public rejection of the universal basic education policy, it shows that the community's response to the basic education universal education program is increasing as well, accompanied by growing awareness about the importance of education for children. Even though there are still some people, especially those with universal basic education age children who have not complied with their obligation to send their children to school.

4.6. Aspects of Accuracy in the Evaluation of Universal Basic Education Policies in Bolaang Mongondow Regency

The substance of the universal education policy for basic education is the embodiment of the state's obligation to the rights of citizens to obtain an equal (fair) education, as well as the obligation of citizens to comply with and use their right to obtain education acceptable laws and regulations. The criteria of appropriateness are closely related to substantive rationality because the question of accuracy is not concerned with an individual criterion unit but two or more criteria together. Dunn (2003) explained that "accuracy refers to the value or value of program objectives and the strength of the assumptions underlying these goals. While all other criteria do not question the goal, the criterion of appropriateness questions whether the goal is appropriate for society. To answer this question, the analyst can consider all the

criteria together, namely criteria that reflect the relationship between various forms of rationality, and apply criteria that have a higher level of abstraction (metacriteria) that are logical before effectiveness, efficiency, adequacy, similarity, and responsiveness."

Based on these thoughts, it raises the question, is the policy of universal basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency appropriate? The substance of the universal education policy for basic education is the embodiment of the state's obligation to the rights of citizens to obtain an education. Various efforts have been made by the government and local governments through the Bolaang Mongondow District Education Office such as a) expansion of access and opportunities to obtain basic education, b) development of basic education facilities/infrastructure, c) implementation of basic education curriculum, d) procurement, distribution, and improvement of teachers' professional abilities, and e) distribution of BOS funds for basic education. The efforts made and described in the results of this study are very useful or valuable for the policy of universal education in basic education so that the criteria for appropriateness or feasibility in the evaluation of universal basic education policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency are met.

5. Conclusion and Suggestions

5.1. Conclusion

This article is the first to discuss the policy of universal basic education in Bolaang Mongondow, North Sulawesi Province, Indonesia.

The evaluation of the universal education policy for basic education in Bolaang Regency has been carried out periodically in Regulation Number: 47 of 2008 concerning Universal Education, by the evaluator team, with the substance of the evaluation on the aspects of: a. Achievement of universal basic education policy; b. Implementation of the basic education curriculum; c. Student learning outcomes; d. Budget realization.

The results of the research related to the aspect of effectiveness in the evaluation of universal education policies for basic education at the elementary school level have met the effectiveness value; at the junior high school level, they have not met the targets set nationally. The efficiency aspect in the evaluation of the universal education policy for basic education in the Bolaang Mongondow Regency has not been fully achieved according to the effectiveness criteria. The aspect of adequacy in the evaluation of the universal basic education policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency is the conditions of changing costs and changing effectiveness, in other words, the policy is to maximize the ratio of effectiveness to cost. The smoothing criteria in the evaluation of universal education policy for basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency indicate that universal basic education services at the SD/MI level have been

completed (evenly), but at the SMP/MTs level, efforts are still being made to achieve completeness. Furthermore, the responsiveness criteria in the evaluation of the universal basic education policy in Bolaang Mongondow Regency show that it is increasing, accompanied by growing awareness about the importance of education for their children. Meanwhile, the criteria for appropriateness or feasibility in evaluating the universal education policy for basic education in Bolaang Mongondow Regency can be met.

The new concept from this study found that the aspect of policy compliance is a criterion that needs to be considered and added in evaluating the universal education policy for basic education. This new finding can also be used as input for the evaluation criteria developed by Dunn (2003).

5.2. Suggestions

5.2.1. Academic Advice

1. Every evaluator involved in policy evaluation should know the purpose of public policy evaluation to comprehensively evaluate each evaluated policy.

2. Evaluators should properly understand and understand the substance of each policy being evaluated by using complete and correct information so they use the information for improving policy formulation and implementation.

3. Communication and coordination between institutions, officials and staff, involved in policy evaluation will verify the published evaluation results.

4. Evaluators should understand the policy evaluation criteria comprehensively.

5.2.2. Practical Advice

Prior before, orientation and training should be conducted on the team of evaluators who are involved and involved in policy evaluation, especially regarding the substance of the policy to be evaluated, evaluation methods and techniques, as well as the policy evaluation criteria used.

Acknowledgments

The author expresses his high appreciation and sincere gratitude to all parties who have helped in the writing of this dissertation, namely to Prof. Dr. H. Budiman Rusli, M.S., as the Head of the Promoter Team, Dr. Drs. H. Heru Nurasa, M.A., as a Member of the Promoter Team, Dr. H. Soni A. Nulhaqim, S.Sos., M.Sc., as a member of the Promoter Team, Dr. Ary Bainus, M.A., as the Dean/Coordinator of the Doctoral Program at the FISIP Postgraduate Program, Padjadjaran University Bandung, the Expert Reviewer/Opponent Team and the Professor's representation, consisting of Prof. Dr. Drs. H. Asep Kartiwa, SH., M.S., Prof. Dr. Drs. Josy Adiwisastro, Dr.

Nina Karlina, S.IP., M.Sc., Prof. Dr. H. Obsatar Sinaga, S.IP, M.Si.

References

- [1] DUNN, W.N. (2003). *Introduction to Public Policy Analysis*. 2nd ed. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.
- [2] DYE, T.R. (2017). *Understanding Public Policy*. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall.
- [3] JONES, C.O. (1991). *Introduction to Public Policy*. Jakarta: Rajawali Publisher.
- [4] MANGKUNEGARA. (2006). *HR Performance Evaluation*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- [5] MANTIRI, J. (2019). Evaluation of the Management of Administrative Information Systems at the Department of Population and Civil Registration of the City of Tomohon. *Journal of Policy Studies and Public Administration (Journal Administro)*.
- [6] MOLEONG, L.J. (2017). *Qualitative Research Methodology (Revised Edition)*. Bandung: Teens Rosdakarya.
- [7] NUGROHO, R. (2008). *Gender and Mainstreaming Strategy in Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Student Library.
- [8] SOLICHIN, A. (2008). *Policy Analysis from Formulation to Implementation of State Policy*. 2nd ed. Jakarta: Earth Literacy.
- [9] WOLLMAN, D. (2003). *Introduction to Public Policy Analysis (Translation)*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press.

参考文献:

- [1] 邓恩, W.N. (2003)。公共政策分析导论。第二版。日惹: 加札马达大学出版社。
- [2] 染料, T.R. (2017)。了解公共政策。新泽西州恩格尔伍德悬崖: 学徒堂。
- [3] 琼斯, C.O. (1991)。公共政策导论。雅加达: 拉贾瓦里出版社。
- [4] 曼库内加拉。(2006)。人力资源绩效评估。万隆: 雷菲卡-阿迪塔玛。
- [5] 曼蒂里 (2019)。托莫洪市人口和民事登记部行政信息系统管理评估。政策研究与公共管理杂志(期刊管理)。
- [6] MOLEONG, L.J. (2017)。定性研究方法(修订版)。万隆: 青少年罗斯达卡里亚。
- [7] NUGROHO, R. (2008)。印度尼西亚的性别和主流化战略。日惹: 学生图书馆。
- [8] SOLICHIN, A. (2008)。从国家政策的制定到实施的政策分析。第二版。雅加达: 地球素养。
- [9] WOLLMAN, D. (2003)。公共政策分析导论(译)。日惹: 加札马达大学出版社。

Regional Disparities Analysis among Regencies and Cities in Indonesia 2015–2019

ORIGINALITY REPORT

14%

SIMILARITY INDEX

12%

INTERNET SOURCES

8%

PUBLICATIONS

%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	devotion.greenvest.co.id Internet Source	1%
2	hkjoss.com Internet Source	1%
3	repository.umy.ac.id Internet Source	1%
4	www.meeting.edu.cn Internet Source	1%
5	garuda.ristekbrin.go.id Internet Source	1%
6	oapub.org Internet Source	1%
7	bestjournal.untad.ac.id Internet Source	<1%
8	www.scilit.net Internet Source	<1%
9	rjoas.com Internet Source	<1%

10	eprints.umm.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
11	Michael J. Emeji. "The Relevance of Art Education and the Education of the Nigerian Child: Implications for the Universal Basic Education Policy", International Journal of Art & Design Education, 2008 Publication	<1 %
12	www.x-mol.com Internet Source	<1 %
13	"The Palgrave Handbook of African Entrepreneurship", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2022 Publication	<1 %
14	ejournal.uhn.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
15	jurnal.untag-sby.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
16	www2.ohchr.org Internet Source	<1 %
17	aiesep.org Internet Source	<1 %
18	Sundawa Bahtiar. "New Concepts in Public Service in Tasikmalaya City: Challenges and Opportunities", ijd-demos, 2022 Publication	<1 %

19	ejournal3.undip.ac.id Internet Source	<1 %
20	researchcommons.waikato.ac.nz Internet Source	<1 %
21	serisc.org Internet Source	<1 %
22	Ediyanto, Suhendri, Nurul Hidayati Rofiah. "The challenges of Indonesian science teachers in teaching students with special educational needs in inclusive school", AIP Publishing, 2020 Publication	<1 %
23	www.neliti.com Internet Source	<1 %
24	"The Palgrave Handbook of Race and Ethnic Inequalities in Education", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2019 Publication	<1 %
25	ijisrt.com Internet Source	<1 %
26	Human Relations. "THE ALLEN REPORT ON NEW YORK CITY SCHOOLS", Equity & Excellence in Education, 1964 Publication	<1 %
27	Moh. Alifuddin. "Empowering Non-Formal Education Policy on Life Skills and Its	<1 %

Implications on People Welfare", Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn), 2017

Publication

28 ejournal.kopertais4.or.id <1 %
Internet Source

29 ejournal.mandalanursa.org <1 %
Internet Source

30 etd.umy.ac.id <1 %
Internet Source

31 etds.ntut.edu.tw <1 %
Internet Source

32 www.mordorintelligence.com <1 %
Internet Source

33 Erwinsyah Satria, Zulkifli Musthan, Pandu Adi Cakranegara, Ardian Arifin, Zulvia Trinova. "Development of based learning media with App Inventor", Sinkron, 2022 <1 %
Publication

34 cipacn.org <1 %
Internet Source

35 coaa.discovery.cnki.net <1 %
Internet Source

36 dict.cnki.net <1 %
Internet Source

37 en.wikipedia.org <1 %
Internet Source

<1 %

38

icsse.ppkn.org

Internet Source

<1 %

39

journals.plos.org

Internet Source

<1 %

40

www.rsisinternational.org

Internet Source

<1 %

41

www.tandfonline.com

Internet Source

<1 %

42

Arwildayanto. "Examining the effectiveness of prodira policy on improving human development index at Province of Gorontalo", IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science, 2019

Publication

<1 %

43

journals.scholarpublishing.org

Internet Source

<1 %

44

repository.umpr.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

45

repository.untag-sby.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

46

www.emerald.com

Internet Source

<1 %

47

Zeynep Ozdamar Ertekin, Bengu Sevil Oflac, Cemre Serbetcioglu. "Fashion consumption during economic crisis: Emerging practices and feelings of consumers", Journal of Global Fashion Marketing, 2020

Publication

<1 %

48

www.ifii.org.tw

Internet Source

<1 %

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches < 5 words

Exclude bibliography On